

童雁汝南肖像画的“中间现实”

邹元江^①

东西方都有画肖像画的传统，但差异很大。西方以写生油画为代表的肖像画与当代在技术革新的支持下所带来的“自拍”狂潮，虽然有表象的差异性，但本质上都是一种“自我观照”的行为。马克思说，人们生下来并没有携带镜子，我们正是在对象上直观自身。而这种对象化的自我确证，最直接地就表现在对面部的人格观照上。古希腊的美少年纳喀索斯就迷恋于欣赏自己水中的倒影，虽然这个折射的影子他并不知道就是他自己，但他仍对其美爱慕不已。这正是文艺复兴时期兴盛的西方油画肖像画的哲学根基。西方油画艺术中无论是为“他者”所作的肖像画还是画家的自画像，都是画家试图通过对一个人面部、神情的描绘来呈现揭示具有透明性的人的内在本质的表象。

中国虽然也有类似西方意义上“使人具衣冠坐，注视一物，彼歛容自持”的写生肖像画，但与西方的肖像画在本质上却不同。西方写生肖像画是在逼真上下功夫，中国写生肖像画则是在传神上寻求意趣。既要逼真，就要穷形尽相、纤毫毕现；既要传神，就要“欲得其人之天……此岂举体皆是，亦得其意思所在而已。”

童雁汝南二十年如一日一直执着于西方架上的油画肖像画，但他这些看上去非常标准的静物写生意义上的传统西方油画肖像画，却又画出了完全不同于西方的肖像，也不同于他从李可染那里奠定了幼功的中国传神写真人物画，而是一种超越了外在图像透明性的“中间现实”。这让我们想起用感性抵抗逻辑之“真”的透明性的梅洛-庞蒂。

梅洛-庞蒂认为，如同周围世界一样，世界“是处于绝对观察者眼中的现存世界和绝对主体领域之间的一种中间现实”。所谓“中间现实”既非指西方油画的写实性，也非指中国人物画的写意性；既非指画家眼中的对象世界（真人），也非指作为心灵主体的画家非对象性的世界（具有明晰性的心观意象），而是介于东西方绘-画、主-客体之间的图像世界，这就是在纯粹东-西、主-客之上存在的“第三个维度”。这种“第三个维度”，不仅告别了传统西方写生肖像油画建立在逻辑之“真”意义上的透明性经验论，而且还将“始终发生在世间(Entremonde)、

^① 邹元江，哲学博士，武汉大学哲学学院二级教授、博士生导师，湖北省美学学会会长。

始终隐而不露（的存在）归于日常性（Alltäglichkeit）”。梅洛-庞蒂从人的“处境”的现象学意义上指出，不应“试图把局部的、分散的现象夹在镊子尖上仔细查看”，而应归还“物”原有的晦暗性，将“有机组织或种类看作大块现实”。画家的“镊子尖”就是画笔尖。油画笔的笔尖其实并不能写生描摹出人的存在本质的透明性之“真”。与其煞费苦心欲写生出人的外在似真似幻的表象，不若像童雁汝南这般回归人作为世间最高存在物作为“物”的本源的晦暗性、混沌性、轮廓性。这就是童雁汝南通过他的肖像画所注解的梅洛-庞蒂所说的“绘画的非逻辑本质”的“可见的本体论”（图像本体论）的意义。

“Intermediate Reality” in Portraits Made by Tong Yanrunan

Zou Yuanjiang^①

Both portrait painting in the East and the West have traditions, but there are great differences between them. Although western portrait paintings represented by oil painting and “self-portrait” boom supported by technological innovation in the contemporary era are different in appearance, it is a kind of “self-observation” behavior in essence. Marx said that people were not born with mirrors. We are intuiting ourselves on objects. And the most direct reflection of objectified self-confirmation is the observation of personality on the face. Narcissus, for example, a young Greek beauty, was obsessed with enjoying his reflection in the water. Although he did not know it was him, he still admired his beauty. This is the philosophical foundation of the flourishing Western oil painting portraits in the Renaissance. As for the art of western oil painting, painters always try to reveal the intrinsic nature of transparent human beings by depicting a person’s face and facial expression in their works, whether it is portraits for the “other” or self-portraits of painters.

Similarly, China has an idea that “one dressed neatly and sits quietly, focuses his look at a certain thing, and his face will be painted” to be a portrait, but it is different from western portraits in essence. Western portraits tend to be true to life, while Chinese portraits seek interest and charm by vividness. If we want a lifelike portrait, we need to give a penetrating description; if we want a lifelike portrait, we need to “get his charm.....it is not necessary to be alike from head to foot, but to catch and draw the personality characteristics that best represent the spirit of the person. ”

Tong Yanrunan has been sticking to the oil painting portraits on the Western shelves for twenty years. His works, however, which considered as extreme standard traditional western oil painting portraits of still life, are not the same as portraits from the West completely, nor Chinese vivid biographical portraits, which he laid a

^① Zou Yuanjiang, PHD. The Second-grade Professor and Doctoral Supervisor of School of Philosophy, Wuhan University. President of Hubei Aesthetics Society.

foundation for his youthful work from Li Keran. They surpass the transparency of the external image of “Intermediate Reality”. He reminds us of Maurice Merleau-Ponty, who resists the transparency of logic’s “truth” with sensibility.

Merleau-Ponty believes that, the world around us is “an intermediate reality between the existing world, which exists in the eyes of the absolute observer, and the field of absolute subject”. The so-called “intermediate reality” refers neither to the realism of western oil painting, nor to the freehand brushwork of Chinese figure painting; neither to the object world (real person) in the painter’s eyes, nor to the non-object world (mental image with clarity) of the painter as the subject of the soul, but to the image world between the East and the West, between the subject and the object. It is the third dimension of existence above pure relationship between East-West and between subject- object. This “third dimension” not only gets rid of the transparent empiricism of traditional western oil painting, which based on the logical “true” meaning, but also attributes “(existence) to be daily, which is happening (Entremonde) but being hidden (Alltäglichkeit) in the world.” From the perspective of phenomenology of human’s “situation”, Merleau-Ponty pointed out that “partial and scattered phenomena should not be examined carefully on the tip of tweezers”, and we should restore the “thing” to its original obscurity and “organic organizations or categories should be regarded as big realities”. The “tip of tweezers” for a painter is the tip of a brush. In fact, the tip of the oil brush cannot depict the transparent “truth” of human existence. Rather than painstakingly portraying the appearance of human beings, it appears to reflect obscurity, chaos and profile as Tong Yanrunan, who regard human beings as the highest being in the world as the origin of things. This is the meaning of the “visible ontology” (image ontology) of “illogical nature of painting” as described by Merleau-Ponty, who was annotated by Tong Yanrunan through his portraits.